

Minutes from MATC Board Meeting 4/16/2008

The President declared this meeting to be a "closed session." See Article V.1-g(iv) "Attendance" of the Constitution.

Board Members Present:

Hirak Parikh (President)
Aleric Soans (Vice President)
Solveig Heinz (Treasurer)
Anjali Purkayastha (Director of Operations)
Elizabeth Garcia (Secretary)
Andrew DeOrio (Webmaster)
Rahul Mhaskar (Registration Officer)

No Board members were absent.

Quorum was met.

The meeting was called to order at 9:40 pm.

Agenda:

1. Invite all parties in the complaint against Y.V. and A.B. regarding the 2007 Alicia Pons workshop to verbally respond to the complaint. (Written responses were received prior to the meeting.)
2. Invite all parties in complaint by a member to respond to the complaint. (Written responses were received prior to the meeting.)
3. Final decision regarding complaint against Y.V. and A.B.
4. Final decision regarding complaint by a member.

1. A complaint was received by the Board that outlined concerns regarding the circumstances surrounding the 2007 Alicia Pons workshop. Two Club members (Y.V. and A.B.) were cited in the complaint as having acted in "fraudulent manner." The complaint was sent to both Y.V. and A.B. and written responses were received by both parties.

Y.V. and A.B. were invited to each respond to the complaint that was received by the Board regarding the 2007 Alicia Pons workshop individually. They opted to respond together.

- Y.V. apologized for trying to bring Alicia Pons to teach outside of the Club after volunteering to bring her to teach inside of the Club.
- Y.V. stated some concern about the "evidence" brought forward by O.P. It was furthermore stated that Y.V. was very uncomfortable with the evidence.
- Y.V. would like an apology for all of the slanderous comments.
- Y.V. expressed a hope that "we can all move forward" and asked for a respect of privacy.
- In direct response to the accusations made in the complaint, Y.V. stated that the prices were the same when the workshop was being organized outside of the Club as they were when the

workshop was being organized within the Club, therefore Y.V.'s "intent was not to get rich."
- Y.V. also pointed out that Alicia Pons was comfortable while she was here, a profit was made on the workshops, and Alicia Pons has returned to the community.

- A.B. stated that the role held in organizing the workshop was as a "helper" due to skills in making a website.
- A.B. stated that the website maintained is not a business, rather a website that markets events outside of the Club.
- A.B. stated that the issue was resolved in February of 2007.
- A.B. raised concern regarding privacy issues and stated that this is a "clear case of defamation."
- A.B. stated that there "may be a piece of truth, but much of it is false."

Y.V. and A.B. were then asked some questions by the Board.

Q: (directed toward Y.V.) Were you appointed an E.O. by the Club to organize the Alicia Pons 2007 workshop?

Y.V. stated that the Club never officially appointed him/her as an E.O. but that (s)he had asked to organize the workshop and the Club had agreed. Y.V. agreed that (s)he was acting as an agent of the Club at that time.

Q: How did it come that the workshop weekend was taken outside of the Club and promoted on a separate website?

Y.V. stated that the workshops were first advertised on a separate website, due to Y.V.'s own uncertainty as to whether the workshop weekend was going to happen through the Club. Y.V. stated that 3 people paid via Paypal on the website and that by the time any checks arrived, the event had already been switched back to being organized through the Club. All monies were accounted for in the final financial report given to the Board.

Y.V. stated that A.B. had offered the opportunity to organize the event.

A.B. stated that an email had been received from Barbara (Alicia Pons' agent) and that (s)he was not an agent of the Club when receiving that email.

Q: Were you on the Board at this time?

Y.V. stated that (s)he didn't think of it as a Board.

A.B. stated that (s)he has been a Board member since 2002.

Q: Did you find this to be a conflict of interest?

A.B. maintained that the emails received were received as a separate agent.

A.B. further stated that checks cannot be written to the website, they are written to whoever is running the classes.

A.B. owns the website as a marketing tool ("think of it as a flyer").

Q: If you were both involved with the Club, why did you think it was appropriate to advertise a Club event solely on a separate website?

A.B. stated that (s)he told Y.V. to think about it and that if Y.V. wanted to do it then (s)he would do it.

Y.V. stated that A.B. did not ask if there was a contract with the Club.

Q: Do you regret what happened?

Y.V.: "I do have regret for how loosely I handled it; for not treating it with the seriousness it deserved."

A.B.: "I think that there are a lot of things to have regret over."

Y.V. and A.B. were thanked for coming in to speak with the Board. They were informed they would be notified of the decision made by the Board as soon as possible.

2. Parties regarding the complaint by a member were invited to respond to the complaint individually. Parties were not in the room at the same time during individual responses.

A complaint was received by the Board from a Club member (Member A) against another Club member (Member B) "for harassment, insulting and vulgar comments, and random accusations." The complaint outlined a heated conversation which had occurred between Member A and Member B during Club time in which Member B had insulted Member A repeatedly.

Member B's written statement included an apology to Member A as well as to the Board and denied all accusations outlined in the complaint written by Member A.

In speaking with the Board, Member B agreed that a "heated argument" had occurred and that the intent was for it to be a private conversation. Member B stated that a personal apology had been given to Member A at a later time. Member B stated that (s)he had nothing against Member A.

In speaking with the Board, Member A agreed that it did seem that Member B's intention was for it to be a private conversation. Member A outlined the statements that were made to him/her by Member B and how they had affected him/her.

Parties were thanked for coming in to speak with the Board. They were informed that they would be notified of the decision made by the Board as soon as possible.

3. Board reviewed information received through the complaint as well as from Y.V. and A.B. Decisions were made as follows:

a) Motion to hold both Y.V. and A.B. equally responsible for the events as they occurred.

Proposed: Andrew
Seconded: Elizabeth
Vote: 1 for, 5 against
Motion does not pass.

b) Given the information received by the Board from all involved parties, it has been determined that the Alicia Pons 2007 workshop was misrepresented by Y.V. but was not mismanaged.

Proposed: Aleric
Seconded: Anjali
Vote: Unanimous
Motion passes

c) Y.V. will receive the following statement in writing.

We have received your written and verbal response, financial documents, and answers to questions from the members of the Board regarding the complaint made by O.P regarding the Alicia Pons event in 2007. In addition, we have also spoken with A.B and M.R.

We hold you responsible for initial misconduct as an EO and representative of the Club by trying to conduct the event outside the Club without permission from the Board. However, we do not find any evidence of financial or event mismanagement.

You have claimed responsibility and apologized for how the events unfolded. Hence, we are not imposing any sanctions, but we are issuing you a reprimand for your initial conduct as EO. In future, if you are found to be responsible for misrepresentation or any violations of the Club's code as a member/user/representative of the MATC severe sanctions may be imposed.

All efforts will be made to protect your privacy regarding this case.

Thank you for your cooperation with the resolution of this complaint. We hope that we can work together in the future toward the best interests of the Club

Proposed: Solveig
Seconded: Rahul
Vote: Unanimous
Motion passes

d) A.B. will receive the following statement in writing.

We have received your written and verbal response and answers to questions from the members of the Board regarding the complaint made by O.P regarding the Alicia Pons event in 2007. In addition, we have also spoken with Y.V and M.R.

We do not find you responsible for the initial decision to hold the event outside the club. However, as a Board member of the Club at that time, you were aware that Y.V. was appointed as a representative of the Club to bring Alicia Pons. We also feel that as an experienced Board member you should have brought this to the attention of the Board and not have agreed to advertise the event and set up a separate payment account on your personal website. You have expressed regret about how the events unfolded.

In future, we suggest that you check with the MATC Board before you promote or make announcements regarding Club events.

Thank you for your cooperation with the resolution of this complaint. We hope that we can work together in the future toward the best interests of the Club

Proposed: Elizabeth

Seconded: Anjali

Vote: Unanimous

Motion passes

4. Information regarding the member complaint was reviewed by the Board and a decision was made regarding the complaint. Member B will receive the following statement in writing.

We have received your written and verbal response, and answers to questions from the members of the Board regarding the complaint made by [Member A].

Your conversation with [Member A] violates the MATC Code of Conduct. You have apologized for your conduct in your written and verbal response.

The Board does not condone such behavior from any member/user of the Club. Please send [Member A] a written apology for your conduct.

We are issuing you a reprimand for misconduct as a member of the MATC. In future, if you are found responsible for Club rule violations, sanctions may be imposed.

All efforts will be made by the Board to protect your privacy.

Thank you for your cooperation with the resolution of this complaint.
We hope that we can work together in the future toward the best
interests of the Club.

Proposed: Rahul
Seconded: Andrew
Vote: Unanimous
Motion passes

Meeting was adjourned at 10:50 pm.